

## **“History of Tabari”: True Story why Sahabas killed Uthman**

*All the Traditions of 35 Hijri year from History of Tabari (in ordered form), which tell the true story how & why Uthman was killed by thousands of Sahaba & Tabeen of Madina (and other cities)*

If one really want to know the reasons how and why 3<sup>rd</sup> Caliph was killed in Center of Islamic Caliphate in presence of thousands of Sahaba & Tabaeen, then one has to focus on the Detailed and Ordered events of 35 Hijri (year), as they tell us:

- Why did the companions of Muhammad P.B.U.H turned against Uthman?
- What were the main complaints made by the people of other provinces (due to the wrong doings of Governors of Banu Umayyah)
- The character of people of Madina and how they participated in the murder of Uthman.
- The response to those complaints, 'Uthman mad some fatal mistakes, and false promises and 'Uthman even tried to kill the Egyptians.
- The efforts of Ali Ibn Abi Talib to resolve the whole issue which went in vain due to the false promises made by 'Uthman.

In following, we are going to present all the Traditons about 35 Hijri from "History of Tabari" in Ordered form, **except for the narrations from Saif Ibn Umar, which are totally lies and reported only and only by him and contradicting all other narrations.**

## Criticism by Mawla Ali (as) upon Uthman and his Governors

First Tradition:

According to al-Waqidi—'Abdallah b. Muhammad--his father: the year 34 (654-55] certain of the Companions (Sahaba) of the Messenger of God wrote to others [as follows]: "Come, for if you desire the jihad, then the jihad is here with us." The people maligned 'Uthman and censured him in the harshest language ever used against anyone, while the Companions of the Messenger of God were giving their opinions and listening, and among them no one forbade or prevented this save a few individuals: Zayd b. Thabit, Abit Usavd al-Sa'idi, Ka'b b. Malik, and Hassan b. Thabit. The people assembled and spoke to 'Ali b. Abi Talib, and he entered 'Uthman's presence and said, "The people stand behind me, and they have spoken to me about you. By God, I do not know what to say to you. I know nothing of which you are ignorant, nor can I point out to you any affair with which you are not well acquainted. Indeed you know what we know. We have not perceived something before you have, so that we must inform you of it. Nor have we gained sole knowledge of anything so that we must bring it to your attention. In no affair have we been assigned greater distinction than you. You have seen and heard the Messenger of God,

you were one of his Companions and became a son-in-law to him. (Abu Bakr) b. Abi Quhafah was not better suited than you to act rightly, nor did ('Umar) b. al-Khattab enjoy greater merit in any way, and indeed you had a closer blood relationship to the Messenger of God [than either of them]. You obtained a marriage tie to the Messenger of God such as they never did, nor did they have any precedence over you. Remember God! You are not being given your sight after you were blind, by God, nor are you being instructed after you were in ignorance. Verily the path is manifest and clear, and the signposts of true religion are standing upright. "Know, 'Uthman, that the best of God's servants in His eyes is a just imam, one who has been guided aright and who himself gives right guidance, for he upholds accepted prescriptions and destroys rejected innovations. By God, everything is clear. Sound prescriptions stand I clearly marked, as do blameworthy innovations. The worst of men in God's sight is a tyrannical imam, one who has gone astray himself and by whom others are led astray, for he destroys an accepted prescription and revives a rejected innovation. Verily, I heard the Messenger of God say, 'The Day of Resurrection will be brought by the tyrannical imam, he will have no helper and no advocate, so that he will be cast into Hell, turning about in Hell as the mill turns, and then he will plunge into the fiery flood of Hell.' I tell you to beware of God and His sudden assault and His vengeance, for His punishment is harsh and painful indeed. I tell you to beware lest you be the murdered imam of this Community. Indeed it is said that an imam will be killed in this Community, and that bloody strife will be loosed upon it until the Day of Resurrection, and its affairs will become hopelessly entangled. (God) will leave them as sects, and they will not see the truth due to the great height of falsehood. They will toss therein like waves and wander in confusion."

Then 'Uthman replied, "By God, I knew that (people) would be saying what you have said. But by God, if you were in my place I would not have berated you nor left you in the lurch nor shamed you nor behaved foully. If I have favored kinsmen, filled a need, sheltered an impoverished wretch, and appointed as governors men like those whom 'Umar used to appoint, then what have I done-wrong? I adjure you by God, O 'Ali, do you know that al- Mughirah b. Shu'bah is not there?" "Yes," he answered. (Uthman) said, "Do you know that 'Umar made him a governor?" "Yes," he answered. Then ('Uthman said, "So why do you blame me for having appointed Ibn 'Amir, simply because of his close kinship [with me]?" *[Note: This is the biggest Lame Excuse by Nasibies that*

*'Umar also made them Governors. But they totally conceal how 'Ali rejected this lame excuse by 'Uthman]*Ali said, "I will tell you that everyone appointed by 'Umar b. al- Khattab was kept under close scrutiny by him.<sup>253</sup> If (Umar) heard a single word concerning him he would flog him, then punish him with the utmost severity. But you do not do (that). You have been weak and easygoing with your relatives." "They are your relatives as well," answered Uthman. 'Ali said, "By my life, they are closely related to me indeed, but merit is found in others." Uthman said, "Do you know that Umar kept Mu'awiyah in office throughout his entire caliphate, and I have only done the same." 'Ali answered, "I adjure you by God, do you know that Mu'awiyah was more afraid of Umar than was Umar's own slave Yarfa'?" "Yes," said (Uthman). 'Ali went on, "In fact Mu'awiyah makes decisions on issues without (consulting) you, and you know it. Thus, he says to the people. 'This is Uthman's command.' You hear of this, but do not censure him." Then 'Ali left him, and Uthman went out on his heels. Then (Uthman) took his seat upon the pulpit and said, "To proceed: For everything there is some bane and in every situation there is some defect. The bane of this Community (ummah) and the defect in this (divinely bestowed) beneficence are the maligners and slanderers who let you see what is pleasing to you and conceal what is hateful to you. They talk and talk to you. Men who resemble ostriches follow the first one to make a noise. Their favorite watering place is the one far away, they fail to quench their thirst and they get only the sediment. No leader arises, affairs have worn them out, and they possess no means of gain." "By God, you have surely blamed me for things like those which you accepted from Ibn al-Khattab. But he trampled you underfoot, smote you with his hand, and subdued you by his tongue, and so you submitted to him whether you liked it or not. I have been lenient with you. I let you tread on my shoulders while I restrained my hand and tongue, and therefore you have been insolent toward me. By God, I am stronger [than he] in kinsmen, I have allies closer at hand, I possess more supporters. It is more fitting for me [than for him] to say 'Come!' and have [men] come to me. I have appointed over you your peers. I have cheerfully lavished benefits upon you. But you have attributed to me a nature that I do not possess and statements that I have not uttered. Restrain your tongues and your slandering and maligning of your rulers, for I have kept from you a man who would satisfy you with less than these words of mine were he the one [now] speaking to you. Nay, but which of your rights are you deprived of? By God, I have achieved no

less than did my predecessors or those about whose [standing in the Community] you have not disagreed. There is a surplus of wealth, so why should I not do as I wish with the surplus? Why otherwise did I become imam?"

Reference: History of Tabari, Vol.15, Page 140, State University of New York Press

Please remember about this Tradition that:

- Nasibies repeat day and night this lame excuse that Governors of 'Uthman were also present during the time of 'Umar.
- But they totally conceal how 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib objected upon this lame excuse of 'Uthman that during 'Umar's period those Governors of Bani Umaiyah were forced to stay non corrupt by 'Umar, but during 'Uthman's era they became badly corrupt. And instead of stopping their corruption, 'Uthman started abusing the people why they bring complaints against his Governors.

Ibn Jarir Tabari recorded next few traditions from Saif Ibn 'Umar, where he told open lies about Fairy Tale of Abdullah Ibn Saba, that he was a Jew, he used to tell people that 'Ali is successor of Prophet (saw), he incited the people of Kufa and Basra against 'Uthman, he wrote false letters, and great Sahaba like Ammar Yasir and Abu Dhar became followers of this Jew Ibn Saba (We have already dealt with all these allegations in first part of this Article).

Unfortunately, these few traditions of Saif Ibn 'Umar (which are complete lies) are the total asset of Nasibies. But on bases of these few lies, Nasibies succeeded in doing one of the greatest Propaganda of history of Human Race.

## **Muawiyah Threatened the Companions of the Prophet**

Next tradition is as under:

It was related to me by 'Abdallah b. Ahmad b. Shabbawayh-- his father -- 'Abdallah--Ishaq b. Yahya--Musa b. Talhah: 'Uthman sent for Talhah, and I accompanied him. When he entered 'Uthman's presence, there were 'Ali, Sa'd (b. Abi Waqqas), al-Zubayr, 'Uthman, and Mu'awiyah. Mu'awiyah praised God and extolled Him as He merits, and then he said, "You are the Companions of the Messenger of God, the best (of His followers) on earth, and those charged with the affairs of this Community. No one other than you can hope for that (to become Caliph after 'Uthman). You have chosen your companion (as caliph) without compulsion or personal ambition. He has grown old and his life has

passed by. If you had waited for decrepitude [to afflict] him, that would be near at hand. However, I hope that he has revered God so that He will allow him to reach that stage of life. Talk has spread, and I fear it for your sakes, for you have not denounced it in any way. You have my aid (in this matter). Do not inspire the people to long for your government, for by God, if they desire that, you will never see them do any-thing but tum tail and flee." 'Ali replied, "What is that to you, and what do you know about it? You have no mother!" (Mu'awiyah) said, "Leave my mother her place [in the Community]. She is not the worst of your mothers. She accepted Islam and swore fidelity to the Prophet. Now answer me in regard to what I am saying to you." Then 'Uthman said, "The son of my brother has spoken the truth. I will tell you in regard to myself and my conduct in office that my two predecessors (i.e. Abu Bakr and 'Umar) wronged both themselves and those who followed in their path.*[Note: 'Uthman starts blaming the previous two caliphs rather than accepting His own mistake. If He considered them to be on the wrong path, why didn't he say so during their lives? And why did He swore to follow their Sunnah when He was appointed as the caliph?]* Indeed the Messenger of God used to bestow (public funds) upon his relatives *[Note: 'Uthman is indicating towards "KHUMS" money here]*, while my near kinsmen were impoverished and possessed few of life's necessities. Thus, I laid my hands on some of that wealth because of my concern for them. It was my opinion that (this wealth) was mine. Now if you regard that as an error, return (the money), my authority will be subject to yours." They replied, "You are right and have done well." They continued, "You gave (public funds) to 'Abda'11ah b. Khalid b. Asid and to Marwan," alleging that he had given Marwan 15,000 (dirhams) and Ibn Asid 50,000,*[Note: If those relatives of Uthman were so Poor, why then 'Uthman didn't help them from his OWN MONEY? Instead of using own Money, 'Uthman gave them money from Bait-ul-Maal of Muslims. And this amount was huge and makes about 1 Million Dollars today]* and they took (these sums) back from those two. They were satisfied with this and departed content.

Reference: History of Tabari, Vol.15, page 152

Following facts are becoming clear from this Tradition:

- Muawiyah openly blamed grand Sahaba 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib, Talha, Zubair, Sa'ad bin Abi Waqas that they were inciting people against 'Uthman while they see their chances to become Caliph after 'Uthman.

- 'Uthman promised at time of taking Caliphate that he would follow the Sunnah of Sheikhain (i.e. Abu Bakr and 'Umar). But here he turned against his promise and blaming Sheikhain for making mistakes.
- It was Allah who made that exception that Only Prophet (saw) and his relatives are given the share from Khums and F'ay Money (Later 'Umar stopped giving this share to relatives of Rasool (saw)).
- But here 'Uthman is making this Khums and F'ay money Halal for his relatives, although Allah didn't make it Halal for 'Uthman or his relatives. (Although 'Uthman has not taken the name of Khums here, but Rasool (saw) gave not even a single penny extra to his relatives except for what had been ordained by Allah. And Fatima Zahra (Salam Allah Alaiha) used to grind flour in hand mill and 'Ali used to work in garden of a Jew.)

The next tradition comes again from Saif Ibn-e-Umar Kadhab in which Saif praises Muawiya for offering Uthman army and help & Support. (Whereas, later another tradition is coming, which is much more authentic than Saif's narration, and which tells that Muawiya refused to help Uthman in time of need).

In this same tradition, Saif is again telling those fairy tales of Sabaiyyah, which have been narrated by none other.

## **Uthman's biddat in Qasr prayers**

This tradition is also from Saif Ibn Umar and he in this fabricated tradition tries to defend 'Uthman's misguided Innovation of "Qasr قصر" prayer ('Uthman used to pray 4 Rakahs of prayer during journey which was against Sharia Rule of offering 2 Rakahs during journey)

Saif, very cunningly shifted whole blame upon SABAIEs that it were only those Sabaies who objected upon 'Uthman for that innovation of Qasr Prayer.

We have already presented Authentic Reports in Part 1 where it is clear that it were Grand Sahabas like 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib, Ibn Masood, Abdul Rehman etc. who used to criticize 'Uthman for initiating the Bidah of Qasr Prayer.

Unfortunately the Nasibies all together ignore all these objections by Grand Sahaba and keep on following the lies of Saif Ibn Umar and blaming Shias that it were their forefathers (i.e. Sabaies) who wrongfully criticized 'Uthman for Qasr Prayers.

## The Contradictory Claim by Saif that Sabaies of Kufa and Basra wanted to see Talha and Zubair as Caliph

Lies have no feet.

Earlier Saif claimed that the Sabaies of Kufa and Basra used to consider 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib as Successor and WASI of Rasool (saw). But in next tradition this same Saif is accepting the truth that:

- The agitators from Basra wanted to see Talha as next Caliph.
- While the agitators from Kufa wanted to see Zubair as next Caliph.

(In next traditions, Ibn Jarir Tabari recorded many times that only the Agitators from Egypt wanted to see 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib as next Caliph, while people of Basra and Kufa wanted Talha and Zubair as next Caliphs).

And that was the reason that 'Aisha didn't stay in Madina, but went to Basra in order to fight with 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib while people of Basra sided with Talha.

**Ibn-e-Jareer Tabari narrates from Ahmed bin Zubair, who narrates from his father, who narrates from Wahan bin Jarer, who narrates from Zahri :**  
**After 4 months of death of 'Uthman, Talha and Zubair reached Macca. Abdallah ibn Amir had gathered a lot of people. All these people gathered in the presence of Ayesha and some suggested that they should go to Madina and fight against Ali while some said that they did not possess enough strength to fight Madinese. Eventually they all decided that they should go to Kufa or Basra while they were supporters of Talha and Zubair.**

**Reference: History of Tabari english edition vol:14 P; 43**

And there are numerous narrations stating that the people of Basra wanted Abu Musa Ashari to be their Caliph rather than Ali Ibn Abi Talib (See History of Tabari, events of year 33 and 34)

Other than these traditions, we challenge the Nasibies to show us even a single tradition (whose chain is free of Saif Ibn Umar Kadhab) and which states that:

- The people of Kufa and Basra ever claimed the Direct Wilayah and Successorship of Ali Ibn Abi Talib.
- That the people accused Uthman that he took over Ali's right of Immamate i.e. all those accusations made by Nasibies that the Shias were the one who killed Uthman since they considered Ali to be Muhammad's (saw) successor.

## Saif's claim that Whole Madina City fully supported 'Uthman

In this next tradition, Saif tried to prove that 'Ali, Talha, Zubair (and all other Sahaba)... all of them fully supported 'Uthman during this period.

Then Saif is also making claim that M'uawiyah sent Army to support 'Uthman (although another Tradition is coming next which is free of Saif and telling us that at that time M'uawiyah turned his face from 'Uthman and didn't sent any help to him)

In this same tradition Saif also tells another lie that except for 2-3 people of Madina people (i.e. Ammar Yasir and Muhammad Ibn Abi Hudhayfa) all the Sahaba and people of Madina fully supported 'Uthman. While all the traditions which are free of Saif ibn Umar, they tell exactly the opposite and they unanimously witness that Talha, Zubair, 'Aisha and whole Madina turned against 'Uthman and used to criticize him severely.

## Saif's claim that Ali Ibn Abi Talib sent Imam Hassan (his son) to protect 'Uthman

In this next tradition Saif claims that 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib sent Imam Hassan (his son) to protect 'Uthman. (And this is the favourite tradition of Nasibies in order to show that 'Ali was supporter of 'Uthman).

After reading all the traditions, it is doubtful that 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib sent Imam Hassan to protect 'Uthman. There are many other traditions which go against this tradition. For example, the book Akhbar-ul-Tawal is authentic historical book of Ahle Sunnah. And at page 173 it is written:

**'Ali Ibn Abi Talib wrote a letter to M'uawiyah and wrote: I have got your letter in which you have blamed me that I left 'Uthman alone to be killed and that I incited people to kill him. I have not done any such thing. When people became angry upon caliph (i.e. 'Uthman) then some of them stopped supporting him while others killed him, while I limited myself only to my house and kept 'Uthman and his problems away from me.**

And if Imam Hassan was really present there in order to protect 'Uthman, and he along with Marwan bin al-Hakam fighting with sword against the opponents, and he (Imam Hassan) became filled with blood in doing so (as Saif claimed), then why this same Marwan bin al-Hakam later blamed 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib that he let 'Uthman to be killed? The Sunni Imam Muhammad bin Yahya ibn Bakr recorded:

**Marwan bin al-Hakam blamed 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib for the killing of 'Uthman and said to 'Ali: O 'Ali, even if you have not openly killed 'Uthman, but for sure you have killed him secretly.**

How did then Marwan bin al-Hakam forget that 'Ali bin Abi Talib sent his own son Imam Hassan in order to protect 'Uthman, and according to Saif both Imam Hassan and Marwan bin al-Hakam were fighting at door of 'Uthman's house and Imam Hassan became full of blood while protecting 'Uthman?

[Note: Nasibies consider Marwan bin al-Hakam as very pious personality and therefore use “Radhi Allaho Anho” for him. See the Book „Barat-e-Uthman“ at official Sapah Sahaba website]

Now for sake of argument, let us consider it to be the truth that 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib sent Imam Hassan to protect 'Uthman. Still one thing is very much sure that the conclusion drawn from it by Nasibies is totally wrong i.e. Nasibies claim that 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib sent Imam Hassan while he was fully supporting 'Uthman and considered him totally right and free of all mistakes etc.

Contrary to Nasibies conjecture, it is very clear that 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib used to criticize severely upon the Innovations (Bidahs) of 'Uthman and wrong doings, and he got nose full of 'Uthman's attitude of making false promises again and again and then breaking them every time. And 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib thought that Marwan bin al-Hakam had converted 'Uthman into such an animal to whom he drove where ever he wanted.

That is why, even if 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib sent Imam Hassan to protect 'Uthman, then it was not for the reason that he considered 'Uthman to be Mazloom or free of mistakes and innovations, but 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib didn't want any bloodbath in city of Madina and considered it against the interests of Ummah (especially the killing of Caliph of time would have made Islamic state weaker and brought a lot of FITNA as it proved correct later).

There are tens of other Traditions which are unanimous that 'Ali was so much angry upon 'Uthman that he even stopped talking with him and he swore to not to involve between 'Uthman and his Opponents.

We have quoted above the tradition where 'Ali was very much clear that according to him 'Uthman had not been killed as Mazloom.

Similarly, you will read in next part of this article (the burrial of 'Uthman) that the dead body of 'Uthman was kept without coffin for 3 days in Madina and no Sahabah came to bury him. Neither 'Ali, nor Imam Hassan participated in his bath and coffin and burial even after 3 days, and this fact is enough to refute the Nasibies claim that 'Ali considered 'Uthman to be Mazloom and on right.

Moreover, another question arises for Nasibies, if it were really Shias (i.e. Sabaies) who killed 'Uthman, then:

- According to your claim Sabaies considered 'Ali as their god, then how came they disobeyed

their god and didn't return back when 'Ali was telling to return back?

- Where was 'Abdullah Ibn Saba himself personally during all these events in Madina?
- Another question is: Did 'Ali ever say once that the demands of the people of Egypt , Kufa and Basra were wrong? (If you claim he said that, then please present a tradition whose chain is free of Saif Ibn 'Umar).

For the 1400 years our Opponents have not given answers to these historical facts, but they keep on crying Sabaies Sabaies for all these centuries.

The next few tradition have once again been quoted by Saif Ibn Umar by Ib Jarir Tabari, and they are telling the same fairy tales which are contradictory to all other Traditions which are free of Saif Ibn 'Umar (like lies that all Sahaba were supporting 'Uthman etc.). Few more claims where Saif Ibn 'Umar is unique (i.e. No one else other than him mentioned that) are as under:

- Saif's allegation that Agitators wrote false Briefs to Sahaba (Note: There is no mention of any such fake Briefs by Agitators in Traditions which are free of Saif Ibn 'Umar)
- Saif's claim that 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib cursed the People of Egypt, Kufa and Basra who gathered there to demand their rights.(All tens of traditions which are free of Saif, they tell the contradictory that 'Ali always took side of agitators and always deemed them right and he always criticized 'Uthman that Marwan always misguided him and compelled him to break his promises.)
- Saif's claim that Talha and Zubair also sent lanah upon the agitators and strongly supported 'Uthman (While traditions which are free of Saif, they tell us how Talha and Zubair played big role in assassination of 'Uthman).

**Ibn Jarir recorded next traditions from al-Waqidi. Ibn Jarir Tabari writes:As for al-Waqidi, he has recounted many things concerning the reasons why the Egyptians went to Uthm an and made camp at Dhu Khushub. Among these are things that I have already men-tioned, and there are others that I have refused to mention because I find them offensive. Among his various accounts, (al-Waqidi) mentions that it was related to him by 'Abdallah b. Jafar—Abu 'Awn, the client of al-Miswar: 'Amr b. al-'As had been Uthman's governor ('ami1) in Egypt. Then he stripped him of authority over the tax revenues (kharaj) and put him in charge of the public prayers. (Uthman) assigned authority over the tax revenues to 'Abdallah b. S'ad, and then combined both offices under 'Abdallah. When 'Amr b. al-As arrived in Medina, he launched vitriolic attacks upon Uthman. One day Uthman sent for him and met with him alone. He said,**

"Ibn al-Nabighah, how quickly the neckhole of your gown has become louse-ridden! You faithfully carried out your duties as governor for a year previous [to this). Do you attack me, bearing one countenance in my presence and another in my absence? By God, were it not for a morsel of food [proffered you by my enemies), you would not do that. 'Amr replied, "Indeed much of what the people say and communicate to their rulers is falsehood. So fear God, O Commander of the Faithful, in regard to your subjects." Uthman said, "By God, I appointed you as governor in spite of your faults and all the talk about you." 'Amr responded, "I was governor on behalf of Umar b. al-Khattab, and at the time of his passing he was well satisfied with me."

Uthman said, "If I had controlled you as stringently as Umar did, by God, you would act rightly. But I have been lenient with you and so you have been insolent with me. By God, I possess greater glory than you through my next of kin in the Time of Ignorance and before I acquired my present authority." 'Amr replied, "Stop this! Praise be to God, who honored and guided us by Muhammad. I saw {my father} al-'Asi b. Wa'il and I saw your father 'Affan, and by God al-'As was nobler than your father!" Uthman was caught short and said, "Why should we be referring to the Time of Ignorance?" 'Amr departed, and Marwan entered and said, "O Commander of the Faithful, you have come to a state of things where 'Amr b. al-'As can talk about your father!" Uthman replied, "Leave off! If a man mentions [other] men's fathers, they will mention his father." Thus, 'Amr departed from Uthman filled with hatred for him. At one point he came to 'Ali to incite him against Uthman. Then he approached al-Zubayr and Talhah in succession to incite them. He confronted the Pilgrimage caravan to inform them of Uthman's wrongful innovations. When 'Uthman was besieged for the first time, ('Amr) went from Medina until he reached a property that he owned in Palestine called al-Sab', and took up residence, in a castle of his named al-'Ajlan. He would say, "It is wonderful what we hear about Ibn 'Affan." While he was seated in that castle of his, with Salamah b. Rawh al-Judhami and his two sons Muhammad and 'Abdallah, a rider passed by them. 'Amr called out to him. "Where have you come from?" "From Medina," he answered. ('Amr) said, "What has that man done?" »'-that is, Uthman. (The rider) said, "I left him tightly besieged." 'Amr said, "I am Abu 'Abdallah. Perhaps the jackass is breaking wind and the flatiron is in the fire."

('Amr) had not left his seat before a second rider passed by. 'Amr called out to

him, "What has that man done? "that is, Uthman."He has been killed," he replied. ('Amr) said, "I am Abu 'Abdallah. When I rub a scab, I scrape it off?") I have been inciting [people] against him, even the shepherd on the mountaintop with his flock." Then Salamah b. Rawh said to him, "O leaders of Quraysh, verily there was a strong gate between you and the Arabs and you have broken it down. Whatever led you to do that?" ('Amr) said, "We wanted to draw the truth out of the pit of falsehood and to have the people be on an equal footing as regards the truth." 'Uthman's half—sister on his mother's side, Umm Kulthum bt. Uqbah b. Abi Mu'ayt, used to dwell with 'Amr, then he separated from her when Uthman deposed him.

## **Ali Ibn Abi Talib complaining against the Companions of 'Uthman (Marwan b. al-Hakam, Sa'id b. al-'As, Ibn 'Amir, and Mu'awiyah)**

According to Muhammad b. Umar (al-Waqidi)—'Abdallah b. Muhammad-his father: ... " When the dissidents established their camp at Dhu Khushub, the news spread that they intended to kill 'Uthman if he did not abdicate. At night their envoy came to 'Ali, Talhah, and 'Ammar b. Yasir successively. Muhammad b. Abi Hudhayfah had joined them in writing a letter to 'Ali, they brought this to 'Ali, but he did not examine its contents. When 'Uthman perceived all this, he came to 'Ali. He entered his house and said, "O cousin, nothing owed to me can be neglected, my kinship [with you] is close, and I have a strong claim upon your support. You see the trouble caused by this band of dissidents when they came to me today. I know that you enjoy prestige among the people and that they will listen to you. I want you to ride out to them and send them away from me. I do not wish them to come before me, for that would be an insolent act toward me on their part. Let others hear of this as well." 'Ali said, "On what grounds shall I send them away?" ('Uthman) replied, "On the grounds that I shall carry out what you have counseled me to do and thought right, and that I will not deviate from your direction." Then 'Ali said, "In fact I have spoken to you time after time, and you and I have discussed such matters at length. All this is the doing of Marwan b. al-Hakam, Sa'id b. al'As, Ibn 'Amir, and Mu'awiyah. You have heeded them and defied me." 'Uthman said, "Then I shall defy them and heed you." ('Ali) thus issued orders to the people, and both Emigrants and Helpers rode forth with

him [to meet with the dissidents].

## Witness of the Pure Intentions of 'Abd al-Rahman b. 'Udays

According to Muhammad bin Umar---Muhammad bin Salih---Asim bin Umar---Mahmud bin Labid---Muhammad bin Maslamah: " We did not leave Dhu Khushub until they had set out on their journey back to Egypt. They began to say their farewells to me, and I (namely, Muhammad b. Maslamah] shall not forget the statement of 'Abd al-Rahman b. 'Udays: "O Abu 'Abd al-Rahman, do you enjoin anything upon us?" I responded, "You I should fear God alone, Who has no partner and you should send those around you away from their imam, for he has promised us that he will return (to what is good] and desist (from what is evil]." Ibn 'Udays said, "I shall, God willing." Thus, the delegation (qawm) returned to Medina.

Nasibies try to present 'Abd al-Rehman bin 'Udays as evil person today and use bad words for him. But 'Abd al-Rehman is a Companion (Sahabi) of Rasool (saw) and he also participated in Bait-e-Ridhwan.

Now people could themselves watch the Pure Intentions of this Sahabi 'Abd al-Rehman and could do the justice. For us, he was totally correct in his demands against the injustices of Bani Ummayyah and 'Uthman and proof of this is that 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib supported his demands and always deemed 'Uthman to be on wrong path).

Even if this Sahabi was wrong, still why Nasibies don't deem it to be an "Ijtehaadi Mistake"? After all Stars like this Sahabi, who also participated in Bait-e-Ridhwan, he rose up in same way that 'Aisha rose up in rebellion in name of "Correcting the Ummah" (اصلاح).

Whatever, our challenge to Nasibies is to prove that this Sahabi (the participant of Bait-e-Ridhwan) was the follower of 'Abdullah Ibn Saba and Shias are responsible for his action of killing 'Uthman.

ابن عبد البر في الاستيعاب 2:411

عبد الرحمن بن عديس البلوي مصري شهد الحديبية ممن بايع تحت الشجرة رسول الله قال أبو عمر: هو كان الأمير على الجيش الذين حصروا عثمان وقتلوه

Translation:

The Imam of Ahle Sunnah Ibn 'Abdul Bar wrote in his book al-Isti'aab (2:411):

'Abd al-Rehman bin 'Udays al-Balwi was present at Hudaybiah and he was included in those who gave the allegiance under the tree. Abu 'Umar said: He was the leader of that army which attacked 'Uthman and then killed him.

Also Ibn Hajar wrote in his book al-A'sabah, volume 4, page 281:

قال ابن حجر في الاصابة ج 4 ص 281

وقال بن البرقي والبعوي وغيرهما كان ممن بايع تحت الشجرة

وقال بن يونس بايع تحت الشجرة وشهد فتح مصر واختط بها وكان من الفرسان ثم كان رئيس الخيل التي سارت من مصر إلى عثمان في الفتنة

Translation:

Al-Barqi and Al-Baghwi and others said that 'Abd al-Rehman al-Balwi was included among those Sahabah who gave oath of allegiance under the tree (bait-e-Ridhwan). Ibn Yunus also said he was included among those who were under the tree... he was the leader of that army who attacked 'Uthman and killed him.

## 'Uthman telling Lies during Khutba due to wicked advice of Marwan:

According to Muhammad b.'Umar (al-Waqidi)—'Abdallah b. Muhammad—his father: When 'Ali returned to 'Uthman, he informed him that they had gone and said to him some things which were on his mind. He said to him, "Know that I am saying more about you than I have said previously." Then he went home.'Uthman remained at home that day, until Marwan came to him the next day and said, "Speak and inform the people that the Egyptians have gone back, and that what they had heard about their imam was false. Your sermon (khutbah) will spread throughout the lands before the people can gather against you from their garrison towns [in such numbers] that you are unable to fend them off." 'Uthman refused to go out, but Marwan kept after him until he went forth and took his seat upon the pulpit. ('Uthman) praised and extolled God, and then said: "To proceed: As to this band of Egyptians, a certain matter concerning their imam had come to their attention. But when they were certain that what they had heard about was false they returned to their own land." Then from one side of the mosque 'Amr b. al'As called out to him: "Fear God, O 'Uthman, for you have borne great dangers, as we have done along with you. Turn to God, and we shall turn to Him!" 'Uthman shouted back, "So you are over there, Ibn al-Nabighah. By God, your robe has become louse-ridden since I removed you from office." From another direction someone else shouted, "Turn to God and show repentance. Then the people will restrain

themselves from you." 'Uthman stretched out his hands and turned to face the qiblah, saying, "O God, verily I am the first to repent." Then he went back to his house, while 'Amr b. al-'As proceeded to his residence in Palestine. ('Amr) used to say, "By God, if I were to run across a shepherd I would incite him against (Uthman)."

## **'Ali's anger upon 'Uthman due to his 2<sup>nd</sup> breakage of Promise, and declaration of His irrelevance with 'Uthman's actions**

According to Muhammad b. 'Umar (al-Waqidi)—'Ali b. 'Umar—his father: 'Ali came to 'Uthman after the Egyptians had gone and said to him: "Make a statement which the people will testify that they have heard from you, and God will be witness as to whether or not you desire to repent in your heart. The provinces are in turmoil against you, and I fear another company of riders may come from Kufah. You will say, "Ali, ride out to meet them, but I cannot go out and get [them] to listen to any excuse. Still other riders will come from Basrah, and you will say, 'O 'Ali, ride out to meet them.' If I do not do that, you will think I have betrayed our bonds of kinship and belittled your claims [on me]." Thus, Uthman went out and preached the sermon in which he laid before the people his heartfelt desire to repent. He arose, praising and extolling God as He merits, and then said: "To proceed: By God, O people, if any one of you has censured [me], he has not done so for anything that is unknown to me. I have done nothing unknowingly. But my soul has raised vain hopes within me and lied to me, and my rectitude has slipped away from me. I heard the Messenger of God say, 'Let him who slips repent, and let him who errs turn back and not persist in his own ruin. Verily he who persists in tyranny is very far from the true path.' Now I am the first to take warning. I ask God's forgiveness for what I have done and I turn to Him. A man like me yearns to repent. When I step down [from the pulpit], let your notables (ashraf) come to me and inform me of their opinion. By God, if the truth turns me into a slave, then I shall tread the slave's path, I shall humble myself like a slave, and I shall be like the bondsman. If he is held in servitude, he shows patience, if he is set free, he is grateful. There is no escape from God save by returning to Him. The best men among you will not fail to draw near me. If my right hand refuses, then my left hand will surely obey me." Then the people had pity on him, and some among them wept. Sa'id b. Zayd stood up before him and said, "O Commander of the

Faithful, no one comes to you who does not support you. Fear God, in your soul fear God, and fulfill what you have said!" When 'Uthman descended [from the pulpit], he found Marwan (b. al-Hakam), Sa'id (b. al-'As), and a few of the Banu Umayyah at his home. They had not been present at the sermon, and when ('Uthman) took his seat, Marwan said, "O Commander of the Faithful, shall I speak or remain silent?" Then Na'ilah bt. al-Farafisah, 'Uthman's wife from the Kalb tribe, said, "Nay, be silent, for they will kill him and accuse him of sin, he has made a public statement from which he cannot rightfully withdraw." Then Marwan came up to her and said, "What does this have to do with you? By God, your father died without knowing how to perform the ablutions correctly." "Go easy, Marwan," she re-ponded, "in mentioning our fathers. You speak lies about my absent father. Indeed your father cannot defend himself [against similar charges]. By God, were (your father) not ('Uthman's) uncle and would (the caliph) not be distressed, I would tell no lies in informing you about (your father)." Then Marwan turned away from her and said, "O Commander of the Faithful, shall I speak or be silent?" ('Uthman) answered, "No, speak." Marwan said, "You are as dear to me as my father and my mother! By God, I wish that you had made this statement [before the people] while you were still strong and invincible, and that I had been the first to be satisfied by it and to aid [you] in fulfilling it. However, you have said these things when the girth has reached the two teats and the torrent has overflowed the hill tops and when a humiliated man has submitted to humiliation. By God, to persist in an error for which you must seek God's forgiveness is better than to repent because you are afraid. If you so will, you may seek repentance without acknowledging error. The people have piled up at the gate against you like a mountain." 'Uthman said, "Go out and speak to them, for I am ashamed to do so." So Marwan went to the gate, where the people were clambering on top of one another. He said, "Why have you gathered here like looters? Your faces are deformed, and every man is holding the ear of his confederate! Whom are you after? You have come to snatch our power from us. Go! By God, if you mean us [any harm], you will encounter something distasteful from us, and you will not praise the result of your opinions. Return to your homes, for by God we are not men to be robbed of our possessions." The people retreated, and one of them went to see 'Ali and informed him of the news. Then 'Ali came in a rage to 'Uthman and said, "Surely you have satisfied Marwan, but he is satisfied with you only if you

deviate from your religion and reason, like a camel carrying a litter that is led around at will. By God, Marwan is devoid of sense in regard to his religion and his soul. I swear by God, I think he will bring you in and then not send you out again. After this visit I will not come again to chide you. You have destroyed your own honor and you have been robbed of your authority." When 'Ali departed, ('Uthman's) wife Na'ilah bt. al-Farafisah entered and said, "Shall I speak or remain silent?" "Speak," he replied. She said, "I have heard what 'Ali said to you, that he will not return to you, and that you have obeyed Marwan, who leads you wherever he wishes." ('Uthman] said, "What shall I do?" She responded, "You should fear God alone, Who has no partner, and you should adhere to the practice of your two predecessors [namely, Abu Bakr and 'Umar]. For if you obey Marwan he will kill you. Marwan enjoys no prestige among the people and inspires neither awe nor love. The people have only abandoned you due to Marwan's place [in your councils]. Send to 'Ali, then, and trust in his honesty and uprightness. He is related to you, and he is not a man whom people disobey." So Uthman sent to 'Ali, but he refused to come, saying, "I told him I would not return." Having learned of Na'ilah's comments about him, Marwan came to 'Uthman and took a seat before him. He said, "Shall I speak or remain silent?" "Speak," replied (Uthman). (Marwan) began, "The daughter of al-Farafisah ...." Uthman said, "You are not to say a thing about her! How evil is your countenance! By God, she is a better adviser to me than you are." With this Marwan desisted.

## **Talha (companion) banned water on 'Uthman and Ali's providing water although He declared of having no relevance with 'Uthman's actions**

According to Muhammad b. Umar (al-Waqid'i]—Shurahbil b. Abi 'Awn—his father: I heard 'Abd al-Rahman b. al-Aswad b. 'Abd Yaghuth mention Marwan b. al-Hakam. He said: May God disfigure Marwan! Uthman went out to the people and gave them satisfaction. He wept as he stood on the pulpit, and the people wept also, until I saw his beard soaked with tears. He was saying, "O God, I turn to Thee in repentance. O God, I repent, I repent! By God, if it is right for me to become a mere slave, I will be content with that. When I enter my

house, all of you come before me, and by God I will not seclude myself from you. On the contrary, I will give you satisfaction in full measure and more, and I will send Marwan and his kin away." When (Uthman) entered [his house], he commanded that the gate be thrown open. When he went into his house, Marwan came to him and worked ceaselessly to delude him, until at last he beguiled him from his better judgment and eradicated his original intentions. For three days Uthman stayed inside and would not go out, for he was ashamed to face the people. Then Marwan went out to the people and said, "May your faces be deformed! Whom are you after? Go back to your homes. If the Commander of the Faithful needs any of you, he will send for him. Otherwise, he will remain in his house." 'Abd al-Rahman continues: So I came to 'Ali, and found him [in the mosque] between the Prophet's grave and the pulpit. With him were 'Ammar b. Yasir and Muhammad b. Abi Bakr, and they were saying, "Marwan has acted badly toward the people." 'Ali came over to me and asked, "Were you present at 'Uthman's sermon?" "Yes," I said. 'Ali went on, "And were you present when Marwan spoke to the people?" "Yes," I answered. 'Ali said, "God forbid, O Muslims, that if I remain in my house, he should accuse me of abandoning him in spite of his kinship [with me] and his rights. And God forbid that if I speak [to him] and things turn out as he desires, Marwan would trick him<sup>3</sup> and he would become like a captured beast driven by al-Marwan at will [all this] despite his advanced age and his having been a Companion of the Messenger of God." 'Abd al-Rahman b. al-Aswad continues: ,('Ali) kept on until 'Uthman's envoy arrived and said, "Come with me." 'Ali responded in a loud, angry voice, " Tell him that I will not come before him again." The messenger departed. I tried without success to meet with 'Uthman two nights later. I asked his servant where the Commander of the Faithful had been, and he said, "He was with 'Ali." 'Abd al-Rahman b. al-Aswad continues: So I took my leave and paid a visit to 'Ali. He said to me, "'Uthman came to me yesterday and began to accuse me of refusing to see him again and of working [against him]. So I said to him, 'After what you said on the pulpit of the Messenger of God, and after [the promises] you gave of your own free will, you entered your house, and Marwan went out before the people, reviling and insulting them at your gate.('Uthman) responded, saying, 'You have severed the bonds of kinship with me. You have abandoned me and emboldened the people against me.' I [that is, 'Ali] replied, 'By God, I am your strongest defender against the people. But whenever `I have brought to you

any matter that I think you will find agreeable, (Marwan) brings another. You have heard Marwan speak against me and have invited him to enter your presence.' " Then he left and went home.'Abd al-Rahman b. al-Aswad continues: I constantly saw 'Ali avoiding ('Uthman) and not acting as he formerly had. However, I know that he spoke with Talhah when ('Uthman) was under siege, to the effect that water skins should be taken to him. ('Ali) was extremely upset about that, until at last water skins were brought in to "Uthman.

## **Banu Umayyah disrespect of 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib**

According) to Muhammad b. 'Umar (al—Waqidi)-'Abdallah b. Ja'far - Ismail b. Muhammad: 'Uthman stood upon the pulpit on Friday, and praised and extolled God. Then a man stood up and said, "Carry out the Book of God." 'Uthman said, "Sit down." He did so. Three times he stood up, 'Uthman ordered him to sit down, and he did so. Then they began throwing pebbles until the sky could not be seen. ('Uthman) fell from the pulpit and was carried off unconscious to his house. One of 'Uthman's chamberlains went out carrying a copy of the Qur'an and crying out, "Those who have made divisions in their religion and become sects, I am not of them in anything, their affair is unto God." Then 'Ali b. Abi Talib entered 'Uthman's presence while he was still unconscious and the Banu Umayyah were around him. ('Ali) said, "Why, O Commander of the Faithful, have the Banu Umayyah drawn round you like a belt?" They responded, "O 'Ali, you have destroyed us and have brought ill to the Commander of the Faithful. Yea, by God, if you achieve your aims, [then this world will surely become a bitter place for you." Then 'Ali rose up full of anger and went back.

## **'Uthman giving the Camels of Alms to his Relatives**

According to Muhammad b. 'Umar al-Waqidi – 'Abdullah b. Ja'ffar – Umm Bakr bt. Al-Miswar b. Makhramah – her father: Some camels were brought to Uthman as legal alms (sadaqah), and he made a gift of them to one of the Banu al-Hakam (his relative). Having learned of this, 'Abd al-Rahman b. 'Awf sent to al—Miswar b. Makhramah and 'Abd al-Rahman b. al-Aswad b. 'Abd Yaghiith. They took the camels, and 'Abd al-Rahman (b.'Awf) then distributed them among the people while 'Uthman stayed at home.

fter that Ibn Jarir Tabari recorded 5 small traditions which are telling that some people of Madina like Jibla bin Amr al-Saidi, Amr bin al-'Aas and Jajha Ghafari used to abuse 'Uthman openly in front of whole Madina and none of them stopped them.

## **Sahaba of Madina killed 'Uthman. And 'Uthman's decisive plan to kill the people of Egypt, and the insurrection of people of Madina**

It was related to me by Ja'far b. 'Abdallah al—Muhammadi— 'Amr — Muhammad b. Ishaq b. Yasar al-Madani — his paternal uncle 'Abd al-Rahman b. Yasar: When the people saw what 'Uthman was doing, the Companions of the Prophet in Medina wrote to the Companions who were scattered throughout the frontier provinces: "You have gone forth but to struggle in the path of Almighty God, for the sake of Muhammad's religion. In your absence the religion of Muhammad has been corrupted and forsaken. Come then and reestablish Muhammad's religion." Thus, they came from every direction until they killed ('Uthman). When the people turned around to go back after 'Uthman claimed he had repented, he wrote a letter to 'Abdallah b. Sa'd b. Abi Sarh, his governor in Egypt, concerning those who had come from Egypt, for they were the most hostile to him of all the ` provincial garrisons: "To proceed: Look for so and so and so and so, and behead them if they come to you. Look also for certain other men, and punish them in such and such a way." These persons included a few of the Companions of the Messenger of God as well as a body of the Successors. His envoy on this occasion was Abu al-A'war b. Sufyan al-Sulami. 'Uthman mounted him on one of his camels and ordered him to get to Egypt before the dissidents arrived. Abu al-A'war overtook the Egyptians along the road, and they asked him where he was going. "To Egypt," he replied, and he was accompanied by a Syrian from Khawlan. When they saw him on 'Uthman's camel, they said, "Are you carrying a letter?" "No," he said. "Why were you sent," they asked. "I don't know," he responded. "You are not carrying a letter," they said, "and you do not know why you were sent. `Your situation is suspicious." Then they searched him and found a letter in an empty water skin. Upon examining the letter, they discovered that some of them were to be executed and others were to be punished in their persons and property. When they saw this they returned to Medina. The people learned about their return and what had happened to them. They came back from all

the provinces, and the Medinese rose up in rebellion.

## 'Uthman's order to Muawiya to send the Army and Muawiya's insurrection

In next tradition Ibn Jarir Tabari writes that it was related to me by Ja'far—'Amr and 'Ali— Husayn—his father—Muhammad b. Sa'ib a1—Kalbi: The Egyptians returned to 'Uthman after having departed from him because a slave of his, riding one of his camels, overtook them carrying a letter to the governor of Egypt [with orders] to kill some of them and crucify others. When they came back to 'Uthman they said, "This is your slave." He said, "My slave went without my knowledge." They said, "[It is] your camel." He responded, "He took it from the house without my orders." They said, "[This is] your seal." "It was forged," he said. . » When the Egyptians arrived, 'Abd al-Rahman b. 'Udays al-Tujibi and said: They came from Bilbays and Upper Egypt, long-necked, their eyes squinting like bows, Their flanks covered in chain mail. They demand God's due from al-Walid, from 'Uthman and from Sa'id. O Lord, send us back with what we seek! When 'Uthman saw what had happened to him and how many of the people had been sent against him, he wrote Mu'awiyah b. Abi Sufyan in Syria: "In the name of God, the Merciful, the Compassionate. To proceed: The Medinese have become unbelievers , they have abandoned obedience and renounced their oath of allegiance. Therefore send to me the Syrian soldiers who are at your disposal, on every camel you have, whether docile or stubborn." When Mu'awiyah got the letter, he delayed action on it, for he did not wish to differ openly with the Companions of the Messenger of God, since he knew that they concurred [on this matter]. When 'Uthman became aware of the delay, he wrote to seek aid from other provinces... (The armies came from other provinces but when the people made camp at al-Rabadhah—the vanguard having located in a district of Medina named Sirar—they learned of 'Uthman's murder and thus they returned from there).

The Nasibies should get over Ibn-e-Saba propaganda and look upon the character of their beloved Imam Muawiyah who denied to send army to help Uthman. Later, Muawiya's demand for justice (for the murder of 'Uthman) was only a Drama, which he did in order to get support against 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib in the war.

**Ibn-e-Jareer Tabari narrates from Ibn-e-Abbas: Ibne 'Abbas said to 'Ali that Muawiya is a worldly person with materialistic desires and if you let him be the governor of Syria, he will forget the murder of 'Uthman and will favour you. (History of Tabari, english edition, vol:1, P;23)**

But Mawla Ali refused, while he was himself the one who kept on advising 'Uthman to get rid of corrupt people like Muawiya and Marwan during his Caliphate. So, how was it possible for Ali to start making Muawiyyah happy through same corrupt means in order to make his worldly caliphate strong and deceive the people?

If Mawla Ali (as) had to do it, then what difference would have been there between caliphate of Mawla Ali(as) and Uthman?

## **'Uthman once again trying to decieve people of Egypt, and trying to gather Army against them**

In next tradition Ibn Jarir Tabari writes:

**It was related to me by Ja'far—'Amr and 'Ali—Husayn — his father — Muhammad b. Ishaq b. Yasar al-Madani — Yahya b. 'Abbad b. 'Abdal1ah b. Al-Zubayr — his father: The Egyptians in al-Suqya or Dhu Khushub wrote a letter to 'Uthman. One of them brought it to 'Uthman, who did not reply in any way, but ordered him to be ejected from the house. Then six hundred Egyptians marched on 'Uthman. They were divided into four brigades, and the commander of each carried a banner. The overall command was in the hands of 'Amr b. Budayl b. Warqa' al-Khuza'i, one of the Companions of the Prophet, and 'Abd al-Rahman b. 'Udays al-Tujibi (another Companion who participated in bait-e-Ridhwan too). Their letter to ('Uthman) contained [the following statements]: "In the name of God, the Merciful, the Compassionate. To proceed: Know that 'God changes not what is in a people, until The Events of the Year 35 they change what is in themselves. So fear God, fear God! You are in a transitory world, and you must seek its fulfillment in a world to come. Do not forget your share in the world to come, and be not tempted by this present life. Know, by God, that we have been angered for God's sake, and that we find satisfaction in God. Know that we will not remove our swords from our shoulders until you come to us either with frank and unambiguous repentance or with outright falsehood. This is our statement to you, and this is our case against you.**

[Note: For the well being of Muslim Ummah, did Hazrat Ayesha have the right to make na Ijتهادي mistake? Won't the Nasibin give Egyptians the right of Ijتهادي mistake? And even if the Egyptians have made an Ijتهادي mistake, 'Uthman did worse by deceiving them continuously]

God will excuse us for our actions against you. Peace." The Medinese wrote to 'Uthman, calling on him to repent, and swearing by God that they would not desist until they killed him or he fulfilled his God ordained obligations to them. When (Uthman) feared he would be killed, he consulted his advisers and the members of his family and said, "You see what the dissidents (qawm) have done. What is the way out?" They counseled him to send for 'Ali b. Abi Talib and to ask him to turn the people away by granting their requests in order to stall them until reinforcements could get to him. 'Uthman replied, "The dissidents will not be put off. My promises were empty and I did nothing the first time they came. If I give them my promise again they will demand that I fulfill it." Marwan b. al-Hakam said, "O Commander of the Faithful, dealing discreetly with them until you gain strength is preferable to struggling with them at close range. Give them what they ask and put them off so long as they delay in regard to you. They rebelled against you, so they possess no binding commitment [from you]." 'Uthman sent for 'Ali, and when 'Ali arrived he said to him, "Abu Hasan, you see what the people have done and you know what I have done. I fear they may kill me. Send them away from me, and I swear to God that I shall requite them for everything they detest, and I will grant them justice against me or anyone else, even if my own blood be shed thereby." 'Ali said, "The people desire your justice more than your death. I see a band of men (qawm) who will be content only with full satisfaction. When they first came to you, you gave them your promise in God's name that you would turn back from everything that they denounced, and thus you (were able to) send them away. Then A you failed to carry out any of that. Do not tempt me with any thing this time, for I will give them justice against you." "Yes," said Uthman. "Give them justice, and by God I will carry it out in full." · So 'Ali went out to the people and said, "O people, you have demanded justice and (now) it is granted to you. 'Uthman claims that he will do you justice, whether it be against himself or any one else, and that he will abandon everything that you detest. Accept this from him and affirm it." The people answered, "We accept it. Make a compact with him for us, for by God, we will not be content with words instead of deeds." 'Ali said to them, "You will have it." Then he entered

'Uthman's presence and told him the news. Uthman said, "Arrange a delay between them and me so that I will have time to act, for I cannot do away with the things they detest in one day." 'Ali responded, "There can be no delay concerning matters here in Medina. As to matters elsewhere, you may delay as long as it takes your orders to get there." Uthman said, "All right, but give me a delay of three days for affairs in Medina." 'Ali agreed. Then he went to the people and informed them of this. He wrote out a document between (the people) and Uthman that gave him a three-day grace period to do away with every injustice and remove every governor whom they disliked. Then he bound him in this document as tightly as God had ever bound one of His creatures by compact or covenant. ('Ali) had (the document) witnessed by a body of the leading Emigrants and Helpers. Thus, the people turned back from (Uthman) and withdrew until he should fulfill the promises that he had freely given them. But (Uthman) began preparing for war and gathering arms. He had already formed a strong army from among the slaves acquired as part of the caliph's one-fifth share (i.e. Khums Money)." When the three days had passed and he had done nothing to alter anything which was hateful to the people or to remove any governor, they revolted against him. 'Amr b. Hazm al—Ansari went out to the Egyptians in Dhu Khushub and informed them of the situation. He proceeded with them to Medina, where they sent to 'Uthman and said, "Did we not leave you when you claimed that you had repented of your unlawful innovations (ahdath) and turned away from things hateful to us? Have you not given us a compact and covenant before God?" He answered, "I have indeed, and I hold to that." Then ('Amr b. Hazm) said, "So what is this letter that we found in the possession of your messenger, written by you to your governor?" (Uthman) responded, "I did not write it, and I don't know what you are talking about." They said, "It was your messenger on your camel, a letter (written) by your secretary and bearing your seal!(Uthman) replied, "As for the camel, it was stolen. (One man's) handwriting may resemble (another's). As to the seal, it was forged." They said, "We will not act precipitously even though we suspect you. Remove from us your sinful governors and appoint others over us who are not accused (of taking) our lives and property. Respond to our grievances." Uthman said, "How do I look if I name officials whom you desire and remove those hateful to you? Authority (a1—amr) would then belong to you." They said, "By God, you must either do (what you promised), abdicate, or be killed. See to things yourself or leave (them to us)." But he refused,

saying, "I am not one to remove a robe that God has placed upon me." So they besieged him for forty nights, and in the mean time Talhah led the people in worship.

O people of Justice, see it was not Abdullah Ibn Saba but it was 'Uthman Ibn Affan who was conspiring. Please remember that:

\* 'Uthman wanted to kill the opponents and thus he sent letters to his relatives to send the army.

\* In order to achieve his aim, he deceived 'Ali and asked him to let the opponents know that this time, he will consider their complaints.

\* He asked to allow him three days time, the purpose of which was to gather the army. He also used the income of Bait-ul-Maal to buy slaves and create his army.

\* When the people of Egypt enquired of his letter (a plot to kill them), he cleverly refused all things that the slave went without his order, don't know who gave his camel to that slave, don't know who wrote that letter in his name and in writing of his writer, and don't know from where came his SEAL upon that letter, ...etc.

\* And to be honest, the Muslims of Egypt had good intentions because they still said that they did not want to kill him. They just wanted him to consider their demands. But 'Uthman refused and remained busy to plot their murder.

In 'Uthman's defence, the Nasibies have only one lame excuse that Rasool (saw) said that every thing (fraud) is permissible in war. In reply to this wicked Nasibi excuse we say that 'Uthman did not use any trick or strategy in the field of war. He was, instead, plotting the murder of Muslims in his office, on the negotiation table where it is Haram. Did the Prophet ever plotted or planned to deceive any one one negotiation table? Remember the contract of Hudaibiyah and how our Prophet returned his companion to the Meccans. (due to the restriction of the contract). It is an ugly allegation upon Rasool (saw) by Nasibies that he (saw) asks Muslims to deceive others on negotiation table.

## **Malik Asthar and the Murder of 'Uthman at the hands of Muhammad Bin Abi Bakr**

In the next tradition, Ibn Jarir Tabari writes:

It was related to me by Ya'qub b. Ibrahim - Isma'il b. Ibrahim- Ibn 'Awn-al-Hasan - Waththab. According to (al-Hasan): (Waththab) was one of those manumitted by the Commander of the Faithful Umar, and I saw on his throat the scars of two stab wounds, like a pair of leather thongs, which he had

suffered on the Day of the House. According to (Waththab): 'Uthman sent me to summon al-Ashtar and he came . The Crisis of the Early Caliphate Ibn 'Awn thinks that Waththab went on as follows: I laid down a cushion for the Commander of the Faithful and another for (al-Ashtar). Then (Uthman) said, "Ashtar, what do the people want from me? " "You cannot avoid doing one of three things," he said. "What are they?" asked (Uthman). (Al-Ashtar) said, "They ask you to choose between (the following). You may turn their affairs over to them and say, 'This is your affair, choose whomever you will for it.' Second, you may have yourself punished. If you reject these two choices, then this band of men (qawm) will kill you." (Uthman) replied, "As for my turning their affairs over to them, I am not one to remove a robe that Almighty God has placed upon. ..." Al-Ashtar rose and hurried away, while we remained there for some days. Then a little man came like a wolf, peered in through the door, and then left. Muhammad b. Abi Bakr came with thirteen men and went up to 'Uthman. He seized his beard and shook it until I heard his teeth chattering. (Muhammad b. Abi Bakr) said, "Mu'awiyah was no help to you, nor was Ibn 'Amir nor your letters."

[Note: Once again the favourite leaders of Nasibies (i.e. Muawiyah) has been exposed and another witness of wickedness of Muawiyah is present here] (Uthman) said, "Let go of my beard, son of my brother! Let go of my beard!" Then I saw (Ibn Abi Bakr) signaling with his eye to one of the rebels (qawm). He came over to him with a broad iron-headed arrow and stabbed him in the head with it. I [that is, Ibn 'Awn] asked, "Then what happened?" (Waththab) replied, "They gathered round him and killed him."

## **Muhammad bin Muslima's attestation and 'Uthman's attempt to deceive the people of Egypt**

In the next tradition, Ibn Jarir Tabari writes:

According to al-Waqidi-Yahya b. 'Abd al-'Aziz- Ja'far b. Mahmud - Muhammad b. Maslamah: I set out with a band of my fellow tribesmen to meet the Egyptians. They were led by four chiefs: 'Abd al-Rahman b. 'Udays al-Balawi, Sudan b. Humran al—Muradi, 'Amr b. al-Hamiq al-Khuza'i — whose name became so dominant that (the force) was called "the army of Ibn al-Hamiq — and Ibn al-Niba'. I entered their presence as the four of them were in a tent,

and I saw that the people were following them. I stressed 'Uthman's rights and the oath of allegiance that lay upon their necks. I filled them with a dread of civil war (fitnah), and informed them that ('Uthman's) murder was a grave matter, concerning which there was much dissension. "Do not be the first to open the gate of discord. He will turn away from those practices for which you have criticized him, and I will be the guarantor of that." The dissidents said, "And what if he does not desist?" I answered, "Then the matter is up to you." They went away satisfied, and I returned to 'Uthman and said, "Grant me a private audience." He did so. I said, "Fear God, 'Uthman, fear God for your life! Verily these people have only come seeking your blood, and you see how your associates have abandoned you. Worse, they are going over to your enemy." He expressed his consent and asked God to requite me. Then I departed from him, but remained [in Medina] so long as God willed. 'Uthman had spoken [to me] about the Egyptians' return [to Dhu Khushub], he mentioned that they had come for one thing but had obtained something else and then departed. I wanted to come and rebuke him, but I kept silent. Suddenly someone said, "The Egyptians have arrived and are in al-Suwayda'." I said, "Is it true, what you say?" "Yes," he replied. 'Uthman sent to me, for the news had reached him, and the dissidents (qawm) had made camp in Dhu Khushub at that very moment. (Uthman) said, "Abu 'Abd al-Rahman, these dissidents have returned. What should be done about them?" I responded, "By God, I do not know, but I do not think they have come back for any good purpose." (Uthman) said, "Go out to them and send them away." "No, by God, I will not," I said. "Why?" he asked. I said, "Because I assured them that you would desist from certain matters, and you have not desisted from a single letter of them." He said, "God is the one whose aid we seek." I went out, while the dissidents came and established themselves in al-Aswaf and laid siege to 'Uthman. 'Abd al-Rahman b. Udays came to me, accompanied by Sudan b. Humran and his two comrades. They said, "Abu 'Abd al-Rahman, do you not know that you spoke to us and sent us away? And you claimed that our companion (that is, 'Uthman] would cease his reprehensible acts?" "Yes indeed," I said. Then they showed a short letter to me, there was a lead tube, and they were saying, "We found one of the alms-tax camels being ridden by Uthman's slave. We seized his belongings and searched him, and we found this letter on him. It contains the following: 'In the name of God, the Merciful, the Compassionate. To proceed: If 'Abd al-Rahman b. Udays comes to you, give him a hundred

lashes. Shave his head and beard, and keep him in confinement until my orders reach you. Do the same with 'Amr b. al-Hamiq, Sudan b. Humran, and Urwah b. al-Niba' al-Laythi.' " I said, "How do you know that Uthman wrote this?" They responded, "Suppose Marwan has done this without Uthman's knowledge. That would be worse, and he must remove himself from office." They added, "Hurry to him with us. We have spoken to 'Ali, and he has promised us that he will speak with him at the noon prayer." We came to Sa'd b. Abi Waqqas, but he said, "I will not intervene in your affair." We came to Sa'id b. Zayd b. 'Amr b. Nufayl, and he said the same thing. Muhammad (b. Maslamah) asked, "Where did 'Ali promise you (he would act)?" "He promised us that he would go and see (Uthman) at the noon prayer," they answered. ( According to Muhammad (b. Maslamah): I performed the prayer with 'Ali, then he and I entered (Uthman's) presence and said, "These Egyptians are at the door, so give them leave (to come in]." Now Marwan was sitting with him, and he said, "May I be thy ransom. Permit me to speak to them." Uthman responded, "May God leave you open mouthed! Get away from me. You have nothing to say about this matter." So Marwan went out, and 'Ali came in to see him. The Egyptians had told him what they had told me, and 'Ali began to inform ('Uthman) what they had discovered in the letter. (Uthman) started to swear by God that he had not written or known about or sought advice concerning (this letter). Muhammad b. Maslamah [that is, the narrator of this incident] said, "By God he is telling the truth. This is Mar-wan's doing.'? 'Ali said, "Then have them come in and hear your excuse." 'Uthman went up to 'Ali and said, "We are kinsmen through the female lineage. " By God, if you were in this situation I would extricate you from it. Go out and speak to them, for they will listen to you." But 'Ali replied, "I will not do it. Rather, have them enter so that you may present your excuses to them." (Uthman) said, "Have them come in." According to Muhammad b. Maslamah: (So at that point they entered, but they did not give him the greeting appropriate to a caliph. Then I knew that this was evil itself. We exchanged the usual greetings, and then Ibn Udays stepped forward as spokesman for the dissidents. He mentioned what Ibn Sa'd had done in Egypt, recalling his unjust treatment of the Muslims and the protected peoples, and noting his appropriation of the Muslims' booty for himself alone. And when he was told about that, he said, "These are the written orders of the Commander of the Faithful." Then they mentioned innovations which (Uthman) had instituted in Medina——things opposed by

his two predecessors. · (Ibn Udays) said, "We journeyed from Egypt seeking nothing but your blood or an end [to these abuses], but 'Ali and Muhammad b. Maslamah sent us back, and Muhammad assured us that everything we had complained about would be ended." Then they turned toward Muhammad b. Maslamah and asked, "Did you tell us that?" According to Muhammad, "I said that I had." [Ibn Udays continued:] "Then we returned to our country, calling upon Almighty God for help against you, because we had over-whelming proof [for our claims]. Then when we were in al-Buwayb, we apprehended your slave and seized the letter under your seal to 'Abdallah b. Sa'd, in which you order him to flog us, to disfigure us by cutting off our hair, and to imprison us for long terms. Here is your letter." 'Uthman praised and extolled God. Then he said, "By God I did not write it, I did not order it [to be written], I did not take counsel about it, I did not know about it. According to Muhammad (b. Maslamah): 'Ali and I both said, "He is telling the truth." 'Uthman was relieved at this. The Egyptians asked, "So who wrote it?" ('Uthman) responded, "I don't know." (Ibn Udays) continued, "Can anyone treat you so audaciously that your slave is sent on a camel paid by the Muslims as alms tax, your seal is forged, and your governor is written to concerning these grave matters, while you know nothing?" "Yes," he replied. They said, "A man like you should not govern. Remove yourself from this office (amr), as God has removed you from it." ('Uthman) replied, "I shall not remove a shirt that Al-mighty God has placed upon me." The shouting and noise grew louder, and I [that is, the narrator, Muhammad b. Maslamah] thought that they would not leave without attacking him. Then 'Ali arose and went out, and when he stood up I did the same. He told the Egyptians to go and they did so. 'Ali and I each returned to our own homes, but they broke off their siege of ('Uthman) only when they had killed him.

The next tradition is again from Muhammad bin Musaymah and almost the same as above.

## **Marwan blaming Saad bin Abi Waqas for participating in the plot against 'Uthman**

In next tradition Ibn Jarir Tabari writes:

According to Muhammad b.'Umar [al-Waqidi] — Muhammad b. Muslim - Musa b. 'Uqbah — Abu Habibah: On the day 'Uthman was killed, I saw Sa'd b. Abi Waqqas go in to him. Then he came out, saying "To God we belong and to Him

we shall return," on account of what he saw at ('Uthman's) door. Marwan said to him, "Now you are sorry, but you have slain him." I [that is, the narrator Abu Habibah] heard Sa'd say, "I beg God's forgiveness. I did not imagine that the people would dare to demand his blood. I came before him just now, and he made a statement that neither you nor your comrades heard. He renounced all his reprehensible actions and manifested repentance. He said, 'I will not keep on toward ruin, for he who persists in tyranny is very far from the [true] path. I shall repent and desist from evil.' " Marwan said, "If you mean to defend (Uthman), you must get Ibn Abi Talib, but he has secluded himself and will not be spoken to." Sa'd left and went to 'Ali, who was [in the mosque] between the [Prophet's] tomb and the pulpit. He said, "Get up, Abu Hasan. May my father and mother be your ransom. By God, I bring you the best news anyone has ever received. Take care of your cousin, deal kindly with him, spare his blood, and the situation will again be as we desire. Your caliph has given [us] satisfaction of his own free will." 'Ali responded, "May God hear him, Abu Ishaq. By God, I have persisted in defending him until I am filled with shame. But Marwan, Mu'awiyah, 'Abdallah b. 'Amir, and Sa'id b. al-'As have dealt with him as you see. When I gave him sincere counsel and directed him to send them away, he became suspicious of me, until what you now see has happened." While (Sa'd and 'Ali) were thus engaged, Muhammad b. Abi Bakr came and whispered to 'Ali. Then 'Ali took my hand and arose, saying, "What good is his repentance now?" And by God, I [that is, the narrator Abu Habibah] no sooner reached my house than I heard the cry that 'Uthman had been killed.

Next two traditions are about how People came from Egypt and gathered around Madina.

## Talha's Role in Killing of 'Uthman

In next tradition Ibn Jariri Tabari writes:

According to Muhammad (b. Umar al-Waqidi)—Ibrahim b. Sa-lim—his father—Busr b. Sa'id—'Abdallah b. 'Ayyash b. Abi Rabi'ah: I entered 'Uthman's presence and talked with him for an hour. He said, "Come, Ibn 'Ayyash," and he took me by the hand and had me listen to what the people at his door were saying. We heard some say, "What are you waiting for," while others were saying, "Wait, perhaps he will repent." While the two of us were standing there, Talhah b. Ubaydallah passed by, he stopped and said, "Where is Ibn

Udays? " He was told, "He is over there." Ibn Udays came over to (Talhah) and whispered some-thing to him, then he went back to his comrades and said, "Do not let anyone go in to see this man or leave his house." Uthman said to me, "These are Talhab b. Ubaydallah's orders." He continued: "O God, protect me from Talhah b. Ubaydallah, for he has incited all these people against me. By God, I hope nothing will come of it and that his blood will be shed. He has abused me unlawfully. I heard the Messenger of God say, 'The blood of a Muslim is lawful only in three cases: a man who disbelieves after having professed Islam is put to death, a man who commits adultery is stoned, a man who kills except in legitimate retaliation for another is put to death. So why should I be killed?' Then 'Uthman went back [into the house]. According to Ibn 'Ayyash: I wanted to leave, but they blocked my path until Muhammad b. Abi Bakr passed by and said, "Let him go." They did so.

In next tradition again Ibn Jarir Tabari is writing about Talha that:

According to Muhammad (b. 'Umar al-Waqidi]-Ya'qub b. 'Abdallah al-Ash'ari —-]a'far b. Abi al-Mughirah—-Sa'id b. 'Abd al-Rahman b. Abzay-his father: I witnessed the day they went in against 'Uthman. They entered the house through an opening in the residence of 'Amr b. Hazm. There was some skirmishing and then they got in. By God, I have not forgotten that Sudan b. Humran came out and I heard him say, "Where is Talhah b. 'Ubaydallah? We have killed Ibn 'Affan!"

## Followers of 'Uthman started the feud

In next tradition Ibn Jarir Tabari records:

According to Muhammad b. 'Umar (al-Waqidi)-Shurahbil b. Abi 'Awn-his father—-Abu Hafsah al-Yamani: I used to belong to a Bedouin. Marwan liked me and purchased me along with my wife and son, and then freed us all. I used to accompany him. When 'Uthman was put under siege, the Banu Umayyah prepared to defend him, and Marwan entered the [caliph's] residence [and stayed] with him. I too was there. By God, I initiated the fighting among the people by throwing [a stone] from the roof of the house at a man of [the tribe of] Aslam named Niyar and killed him. Then fighting broke out and I descended. The people battled at the door, and Marwan fought until he fell down. I carried him off and brought him into the house of an old woman and locked him in. ...

Next tradition is once again from 'Umar (al-Waqidi) and is same as above

Next tradition is about 'Abd al-Rehman ibn 'Udays how he attacked at house of 'Uthman.

In next tradition, Ibn Jarir Tabari records:

It was related to me by Ja'far b. 'Abdal1ah al-Muhammadi— 'Amr b. Hammad and 'Ali b. Husayn—Husayn b. 'Isa——his father: When the three days following the Feast of Sacrifice had passed (therebels) surrounded 'Uthman's house, but he insisted on retaining his office, and sent to assemble his retainers and close associates. One of the Prophet's Companions, a venerable old man named Niyar b. 'Iyad (He is a companion who didn't come from Egypt but he was from Madina), arose and called out, "'Uthman!" ('Uthman) looked down at him from the roof of his house. (Niyar) reminded him of God and implored him in God's name to dissociate himself from (his evil associates). And while he was speaking, one of 'Uthman's associates shot and killed him with an arrow. ('Uthman's opponents) claimed that the man who shot him was Kathir b. al-Salt al-Kindi, and at this they said to 'Uthman, "Turn the murderer of Niyar b. 'Iyad over to us that we may kill him in retaliation." He replied, "I will not kill a man who has defended me while you intend to murder me.

Please note neither there was any worth of blood of this Sahabi of Rasool in eyes of Uthman, nor in eyes of Nasibies. But for them, if there is Qasas of any Blood, then it is only of the blood of Uthman.

It should also be noted that the intention of Egyptians was not to kill 'Uthman. It was rather to correct him. They gave him a number of chances. And 'Uthman kept on making false promises & conspiring against the & writing letters to plan the massacre of Egyptians.

The next four traditions of Tabari describe, how they entered 'Uthman's house and killed Him.

And the five next traditions are narrated from Saif Kadhab and these are one of the favourites of Nasibies and they point out the following:

- 1) Imam Hassan stayed in 'Uthman's house to protect him.
- 2) 'Ali came to provide water to 'Uthman but the opponents didn't allow to do so (Naturally Saif Kadhaab didn't write the complete truth that it was Talha who stopped water upon 'Uthman)
- 3) Hazrat Ume Habiba came to provide water.

Please be noted if the water was banned upon 'Uthman, then the only person behind this ban was no other than Talha bin 'Ubaid Ullah. So Nasibies should either mention the full traditions mentioning

the person's name banning the water on 'Uthman, or stop weeping upon Uthman.

4) Hazrat Ayesha was very angry upon the agitators and planned to go to Macca for Hajj.

(Traditions, mentioned above, that are not narrated from Saif Kadhab, clearly describe how Ayesha wanted herself to get Uthman killed.)

5) Abu Huraira gathered people in favour of 'Uthman. (None of any narrator mentioned Abu Huraira other than Saif Kadhab)

6) Zubair, Talha, 'Ali and S'ad bin abi Waqas cursed on the killers of 'Uthman. (None of any narrator mentioned this cursing other than Saif Kadhab)

Next 4 traditions again tell how people entered 'Uthman's house and how they killed him.

## **The arrival of 'Uthman's troops and the murder of 'Uthman**

In next tradition, Ibn Jarir Tabari records:

According to Muhammad b. 'Umar (al-Waqidi)—al-Hakam b. al-Qasim-Abu 'Awn, the client of al-Miswar b. Makhramah: the Egyptians steadfastly abstained from shedding ('Uthman's) blood and from fighting until ['Uthman's] reinforcements from Basrah and Kufah in Iraq and from Syria approached. Their coming encouraged the rebels (a1—qawm) to attack. They learned that detachments had departed from Iraq and from Egypt and the latter sent by Ibn Sa'd. Previously Ibn Sa'd had not been in Egypt, having fled to Syria. They said, "We must deal quickly with (Uthman), before the reinforcements arrive (after that 'Uthman's supporters killed the Sahabi Niyaar Aslami and thus war started).

It is a request to ponder on the following points:

1) The Egyptians did not come to Madina with the intention of killing 'Uthman. They came to get their rights.

2) They had no relation with Abdullah ibn Saba and they did not come to kill 'Uthman because they considered Mawla Ali a.s to be the Wali of Prophet Muhammad pbuh (i.e. This is the 1300 years old propaganda of Nasibies that Shias from Egypt came to kill 'Uthman while they considered 'Ali to be the rightful Caliph).

3) But 'Uthman kept on making false promises and he called troops from other provinces to come and kill them. In fact, Uthman would have killed them long before, but People of Madina didn't support him.

4) And when the Egyptians came to know about the plot by 'Uthman, they had no choice left other than to kill him.

## **Ijtehadi Mistake: Aisha's slogan of “Reforming Ummah” VS Killer of Uthman's slogan of “Reforming Ummah”**

It is appropriate to mention an example of double standards.

1) Hazrat Ayesha went to fight Ali in War of Jamal, whereas Allah ordered her to stay at home.

(Surah Ahzab, ayah 33)

Nasibi Defence:

Hazrat Ayesha went out for the correction of Ummah so it was an Ijtehadi mistake and she is entitled to SINGLE Reward.

2) She rebelled against the Rightly Guided Caliph and was the reason for the killing of thousands of Muslims.

The following narration comes from Sahih Bukhari:

حدثنا عثمان بن الهيثم، حدثنا عوف، عن الحسن، عن أبي بكر، قال لقد نفعني الله بكلمة أيام الجمل لما بلغ النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم أن فارسا ملكوا ابنة كسرى قال " لن يفلح قوم ولوا أمرهم امرأة "

Sahih Bukhari, Book of Al-Fatn:

Narrated Abu Bakara:

Abi Bakr said that during the battle of Jaml, following hadith of our Prophet (s) guided me. When he came to know that People of Iran chose daughter of Khusroo as their leader, he said: "No nation will get salvation, who would take a woman as their leader "

Thus, Hazrat Ayesha and thousands of companions and Taba'eens went astray & went to fight under the leadership of a women.

Nasibi defence:

It was an Ijtehadi mistake by Hazrat Ayesha and the companions & they will get single Reward of that.

3) The dogs of Hawab barked at Hazrat Ayesha which reminded Ayesha of Muhammad's P.B.U.H saying and she started crying. But Talha and Zubair provided false witnesses that it was not Hawaab.

Imama wal Siyasa, page 59 Chapter "Dhikr Jamal":

"When she ('Aisha) began her opposition to Ali, she and her supporters began to make their way to Basra. On route, the dogs of Hawab began to bark at them. Ayesha asked Muhammad bin Talha "Which place is this?" He said "Its is Hawab" to which Ayesha replied "Take me back for on one occasion Rasulullah (s) said, 'Amongst you (wives) is one at whom the dogs of Hawab shall bark.' He (s) said to me specifically, 'Be careful, in case it is you'." Muhammad bin Talha said 'Leave these things and proceed'. Abdullah bin Zubayr then swore in the name of Allah that they had left Hawab (behind them) during the first part of the night; he brought some men who testified likewise. The Ulema of Islam have declared the event of Hawab to have been the first false testimony in Islam".

Imam Ahmed records:

Qays said: 'When Ayesha reached Bani Amer's well at night, some dogs barked at her. She asked: 'What is the name of this well?' They replied: 'This is Hawab's well'. She replied: 'I have to return'. Some of those who were with her said: 'Nay you shall go forward so that the Muslims shall see you and Allah makes peace'. She replied: 'Allah's messenger (pbuh) once said: 'Then what would you (the wives of the prophet) do when you hear the barking of Al-Hawab dogs?'

[Musnad Ahmed bin Hanbal, Volume 6 page 52 Tradition 24299](#)

This margin writer of the book Shaykh Shu'aib al-Arnaout said:

'The chain is Sahih and the narrators are reliable (Thuqat), the narrators of the two Sheikhs'

There are many more Sahih Sunni traditions about dogs of Hawab and 'Aisha which you could read at this [link](#).

Again the Nasibi excuse is 'Aisha made an Ijتهادي mistake and Abdullah Ibn Zubayr also made an Ijتهادي mistake by telling a lie.

They consider all these to be Ijتهادي mistakes. If that is the case, why don't then they consider the murder of 'Uthman to be an Ijتهادي mistake too by Muhammad Bin Abi Bakr & Egyptians.

Actually Muhammad bin Abi Bakr and Egyptians were right in their demands, but what 'Aisha and Abdullah Ibn Zubayr did, it is an insult to name it an Ijتهادي mistake. It was a blunder and sin what they did.

Allahuma Sallay Allah Muhammad wa Aale Muhammad